

From: Journal of Physics: Condensed Matter onbehalfof@manuscriptcentral.com
Subject: Your submission to J. Phys.: Condens. Matter: JPCM-115770
Date: December 26, 2019 at 23:15
To: jhirsch@ucsd.edu



Dear Professor Hirsch,

Re: "Thermodynamic inconsistency of the conventional theory of superconductivity" by Hirsch, Jorge
Article reference: JPCM-115770

Thank you for submitting your Paper, which will be considered for publication in Journal of Physics: Condensed Matter. The reference number for your article is JPCM-115770. Please quote this number in all future correspondence regarding this manuscript.

As the submitting author, you can follow the progress of your article by checking your Author Centre after logging in to <https://mc04.manuscriptcentral.com/jpcm-iop> Once you are signed in you will be able to track the progress of your article, read the referee reports and send us your electronic files.

This journal makes manuscripts available to readers on the journal website within 24 hours of acceptance. Please be aware that if you did not tick the relevant opt-out box on the submission form, the accepted version of your manuscript will be visible on the journal's website before it is proof-read and formatted to our house style.

If you are planning any press activity for your article, or are currently engaging in an IP or patent application, you may wish to opt-out of making your accepted manuscript immediately available online. If you do not wish to make the accepted version of your manuscript immediately visible to readers, and have not ticked the opt-out box during submission, please let us know as soon as possible.

Please do not hesitate to contact us if we can be of assistance to you.

Yours sincerely

Qamar Scott and Sophie Nuttall

On behalf of the IOP peer-review team:

Executive Editor - Thomas Sharp

Editor - Jane Hesling

Associate Editors - Georgia Perkins, Miriam Howland and Isabella Formisano

Editorial Assistants - Qamar Scott and Sophie Nuttall

Production Editors - Zora Catterick and Harry Fanshawe

Want to find out what is happening to your submission right now? Track your article here:

https://publishingsupport.iopscience.iop.org/track-my-article/?utm_source=Track%20my%20article&utm_medium=Email

jpcm@ioppublishing.org

IOP Publishing

Temple Circus, Temple Way, Bristol

BS1 6HG, UK

www.iopscience.org/jpcm

2018 Impact Factor: 2.711

Letter reference: SAu05

December 26, 2019

To: JPCM Editor

Dear Editor,

This paper argues that the conventional theory of superconductivity is inconsistent with thermodynamics. This may sound like a far-fetched claim, but it is not so. I have thought about this very carefully and am convinced it is correct. I also propose in the paper how this inconsistency can be resolved.

I hope you will send it to referees that have an open mind about the possibility that BCS theory may not be quite correct, that will judge my paper on its merits rather than dismiss it because it questions established views.

The paper was previously submitted to Phys. Rev. B and rejected due to reports of 3 referees. The reports of the referees contradicted each other, so they couldn't all be correct. I provided detailed responses explaining why in fact they were all wrong. The Editorial Board Member that reviewed the paper, Prof. Dr. Matthias Vojta, agreed that the criticisms of the three referees were unfounded. Nevertheless, the Editor decided against publication presumably because the 3 referees have a reputation of being highly expert in this field.

Thank you for considering this manuscript.

J. E. Hirsch